Assessing Global Citizenship Education and Education for Sustainable Development at school. Insights from the International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS)
Plenary session 2

Valeria Damiani, Associate Professor, La Libera Università Maria SS. Assunta (LUMSA) University, Italy
Assessing Global Citizenship Education and Education for Sustainable Development at school. Insights from the International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS)

Valeria Damiani, Julian Fraillon

5th UNESCO Forum on Transformative Education for Sustainable Development, Global Citizenship, Health and Well-being
29-November – 1 December 2021
The IEA studies on Civic and Citizenship Education (CCE)

1971
The first IEA Civic Education Study
- Measurement of cognitive aspects and attitudes
- Focus on processes inside and outside schools
- Civic education curricula

1999
IEA Civic Education Study (CIVED)
Focus on school-based learning and on opportunities for civic participation in different contexts

2009
International Civic and Citizenship Study – ICCS 2009 (first cycle)

2016
ICCS 2016 (second cycle)

2022
ICCS 2022 (third cycle - upcoming)

Broadening the concept of Civic Education => Citizenship Education:
Civic knowledge, understanding, engagement and interactions to shape communities and societies
ICCS Purpose and aims

**Future citizens**
Investigating ways in which young people are prepared to assume their role as citizens

**Trends**
Monitoring trends in lower-secondary students’ civic knowledge, attitudes and engagement over time

**Challenges**
Addressing persisting and new challenges of educating young people

Inclusion of new contents in the CCE curricula in relation to perceptions of changes occurring in societies
ICCS 2016

Target population: Students in eighth year of schooling
## ICCS Study design

### ICCS 2016 instruments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Instruments</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>International cognitive test</td>
<td>Students, grade 8 or equivalent, 13-14 years old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>International student questionnaire</td>
<td>Students, grade 8 or equivalent, 13-14 years old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Teacher questionnaire</td>
<td>Teachers of any subject in the target grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>School questionnaire</td>
<td>School principals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Regional student questionnaire</td>
<td>Students, grade 8 or equivalent, 13-14 years old, in Europe and Latin America</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ICCS 2016 assessment sample

- ~94,000 students about 4,000 per country
- ~3,800 schools about 150 per country
- ~37,000 teachers about 15 per school
ICCS 2016 participants

24 countries

Europe 16

Belgium (Flemish)  Lithuania
Bulgaria  Malta
Croatia  The Netherlands
Denmark  North Rhine-Westphalia
Estonia  Norway
Finland  Slovenia
Italy  Sweden
Latvia  Russian Federation

Latin America 5

Chile  Colombia  Dominican Republic  Mexico  Peru

Asia 3

Chinese Taipei  Hong Kong SAR  Republic of Korea

Education systems that participated in both 2009 and 2016 ICCS cycles are shown in bold.
The first IEA Civic Education Study

IEA Civic Education Study (CIVED)

International Civic and Citizenship Study – ICCS 2009 (first cycle)

ICCS 2016 (second cycle)

ICCS 2022 (third cycle - upcoming)

Several international themes included:
• foreign affairs and international organizations,
• interest in current events and social problems at national and international level;
• social cohesion and diversity

More relevance to the global dimension:
FROM civic education beyond the national borders TO a broadened scope of CCE (global perspectives and interconnectedness): GCED and ESD
International relevance conferred to GCED/ESD

Sustainable development included as a key concept in the content domain 1 (civic society and systems) (Schulz, Fraillon, Ainley, Losito & Kerr, 2008)

Environmental sustainability: new key focus area, included as a key concept under content domain 1 (civic society and systems)
Global citizenship: included as a key concept in content domain 4 (civic identities) (Schulz, et al., 2015)

GCED and ESD identified as a new focus area of the next ICCS cycle (2022)

UN Sustainable Development Goal 4, Target 4.7
From ICCS 2016...

1. Define the scope of ESD and GCED for consideration by ICCS 2022
2. Map existing ESD and GCED against ICCS content
3. Decide how to deal with: existing commonalities, any missing content
ESD and GCED in the ICCS 2016 framework

Explicitly mentioned

- Pollution and waste
- Renewable / alternative energy
- Land degradation
- Taxation
- Social welfare
- Economic policy
- Minimum wage
- Social cohesion
- Pride/sense of place

Strongly implied and clearly in scope

- Climate change
- Global warming
- Economic sustainability
- Trade
- Tariffs
- Distribution of wealth
- Poverty
- Standard of living
- Sense of global community
- Peace/security
- Interconnectedness
- Global issues
- Empathy, respect for diversity
- Cultural traditions
- Social justice
- Fairness
- Social inequalities
- Positive action
- Human Rights

Global citizenship identity
- Multiple identities
- Globalization
- Rule of law
- Democracy
- Supranational organizations
- Treaties

Not clearly in scope
The ICCS 2022 solution

- GCED as an overarching area
- Sustainable development as a specific content sub-domain (civic principles)
- Items developed to address a range of related attitudes, behaviours and knowledge
- School and classroom contexts for GCED/ESD
Findings from ICCS 2016 (GCED/ESD)
Doctors Without Borders is an organization where health professionals volunteer their time in countries where people require medical assistance.

Q: What is the most likely reason that people volunteer their time to such an organization?

☐ Because they want to influence international human rights laws.
☐ Because they believe all people deserve access to medical help.
☐ Because it is the only way they can get practical experience of caring for patients.
☐ Because health professionals find it difficult to get jobs.

Norway: 94.55%
Dominican Republic: 67.61%

ICCS 2016 Average: 85.63%
Example of a cognitive item (2)

Some businesses in <Exland> have begun to import fruit from another country at a very cheap price. Farmers in <Exland> are angry because they cannot afford to sell fruit at the same cheap price. Some people in <Exland> have decided to buy only fruit grown locally in <Exland>.

Q
What is the best argument against protecting the <Exland> farmers’ businesses?

☐ People have the right to choose who they buy their fruit from.
☐ The farmers will be able to find some other way to make money.
☐ People will always buy the best quality fruit so the price does not matter.
☐ The farmers should just sell their fruit for less even though they cannot afford to.

ICCS 2016 Average: 57.88%

Denmark: 76.17%
Peru: 38.06%
Students perceived a number of environment-related issues as global threats

Students’ attitudes toward the environment and the contribution of schools and communities to environmentally conscious upbringing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>ICCS 2016 Average</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pollution</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Shortages</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Shortages</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infectious diseases</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

49% of the students view making personal efforts to protect the environment as a “very important” part of good citizenship.
Students in schools where environmentally-friendly practices were adopted to a large or to a moderate extent as reported by principals. Of students reported that they had participated in an environmental action group over the past 12 months.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environmental Practice</th>
<th>Adoption Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Energy-saving practices</td>
<td>81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posters to encourage students' environmentally-friendly behaviours</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differential waste collection</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste reduction</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing of environmentally-friendly items</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teachers’ reports on students’ environmental activities at school

ICCS 2016 averages of teachers who reported to conduct with their target grade students the following environmental initiatives:

- Writing letters to the newspapers or magazines to support actions about the environment: 12%
- Signing a petition on environmental issues: 8%
- Posting on social network, forum or blog to support actions about the environment: 15%
- Activities to make students aware of the environmental impact of excessive water consumption: 46%
- Activities to make students aware of the environmental impact of excessive energy consumption: 48%
- <Cleanup activities> outside the school: 35%
- Recycling and waste collection in the <local community>: 41%
A glimpse into ICCS 2022 (GCED/ESD)

**School Questionnaire**
Activities related to environmental sustainability and GCED at the school level

**Teacher Questionnaire**
Activities related to global issues/sustainability carried out with target grade students; preparedness and training on GCED/ESD topics

**Cognitive test**
New GCED/ESD new items (ethical consumerism, migration, environmental protection, international organizations, globalization)

**Student Questionnaire**
Perceptions of global threat, attitudes toward environmental protection, perception of good citizenship, sustainable behaviors
Closing thoughts

Arguably all, most ESD/GCED content is referenced or implied within ICCS

Challenges

• What does this mean for the assessment of GCED and ESD?
• Definitional clarity and scope of GCED/ESD within a study focused on CCE
• Challenges in allocating content across domains
  • When content within scope of GCED is presented in a local context and ESD relates to social and economic sustainability at the country level
• Possible difficulties in identifying different subscales

Opportunities

• The emphasis of GCED/ESD outcomes in CCE offers an opportunity
  • to measure students’ knowledge, attitudes and engagement in these areas
  • to gather data on what happens in schools’ contexts where these areas are highly overlapped
  • to define and clarify shared global understandings and priorities
• ICCS 2022 allows to gather benchmarking data in these areas
Thank you!

Contact
v.damiani2@lumsa.it
iccs@acer.org